

## *Open Letter to the Government of India*

WE, CITIZENS OF INDIA AND REPRESENTATIVES OF ORGANISATIONS named below, are deeply concerned at and anguished by the lack of transparency and non-inclusive consultation processes adopted by the Union Government in the negotiations with a several countries such as the United Kingdom, United States of America, Canada, Israel and the European Union for entering into free trade, comprehensive economic partnership or investment related agreements. Despite its twin promises of greater openness in government and cooperative federalism, the NDA Government continues to pursue opaque and limited consultation processes that characterised similar free trade agreement (FTA) negotiations with other countries under previous regimes.

Even as we express our concerns on the subject, the European Commission (EC) is holding consultations and dialogues with civil society stakeholders in the EU member-states on the social impact assessment (SIA) of the proposed FTA with India. Meanwhile, we in India, are expected to be satisfied with an [occasional tweet](#) on the progress of the negotiations and [brief press notes](#) from the Commerce Ministry about the visit of high-level delegations. The rare statements made by the Commerce Minister or the Foreign Minister are aimed at captains of business and industry and the foreign media. The millions of farmers, workers, artisans, fisherfolk, small businesses, gig workers, home-based workers and others who will be affected by these FTAs are completely invisible in these communications.

In addition to its failure to proactively engage and share information with different stakeholders, the Union Government is also rejecting formal requests for even basic details about such matters. For example, an application submitted under the *Right to Information Act, 2005* (RTI Act) seeking information about the agenda and the minutes of ministerial meetings with visiting EU delegations, representations received from business and trade representatives seeking to influence India's position in the trade talks has been rejected by the Commerce Ministry on grounds of national security and trade secrets (see [Annexure-1 and 2](#) for the text of the RTI application and the Ministry's replies).

The Union Government's rejection of even formal requests for information flies in the face of the mandate of the RTI Act for meaningful transparency in governance and stands in sharp contrast to the EC's openness vis-a-vis its own stakeholders. [Substantive reports of the four rounds of negotiations](#) completed and the textual proposals submitted to the Government of India are all available on the website of the European Commission, for any person anywhere on the planet to access free of charge. What the EU is proposing for inclusion in the FTA on [more than 20 topics](#) such as trade in goods, services and investment, government procurement, intellectual property, sustainable food systems, small and medium-sized enterprises, digital trade, capital movements and state-owned enterprises are all publicly available on this website. The EU has even presented a textual proposal for both voluntary publication of information and responding to formal enquiries from persons about matters covered by the FTA. Unfortunately, there is no official intimation on this side of the Mediterranean about India's response to the EU's proposals or its own textual proposals about these matters. Maintaining opacity about India's position on matters of immense public interest and importance can unfortunately give rise to serious suspicion as to whether the Government is being nose-led in the course of these talks.

Of particular concern to us is also the absence of an obligation on the Union Government to consult with Parliament on FTA-related matters. The Constitutional scheme of division of powers grants the Union Government a monopoly over matters relating to bilateral and multi-lateral treaties, including FTAs. Parliamentary approval *post facto* is also not mandated by the Constitution because the power of ratification also vests with the Executive i.e., the Union Government. However, the FTAs could result in the amendment or even scrapping of several Central legislations that are firmly in the domain of Parliament. Parliament must therefore deliberate on the implications of the proposed legislative changes for the lives, livelihoods and well-being of all citizens, particularly the most vulnerable groups.

The Commerce Ministry's reply to one of the RTI queries states that it is holding consultations only with Industry Associations and relevant Ministries and Departments. This does not inspire much confidence. It is a matter of grave concern that State governments have not been consulted, despite the fact that FTAs cover subjects under the State List and the Concurrent List. The Union Government has also not opened up the consultation process to farmers' associations, labour unions, environmental rights and human rights groups, consumer associations and many others who are legitimate and critically important stakeholders.

This non-consultative and exclusionary process signals a disregard for the questions of human rights, social justice and environmental impacts that wider stakeholder involvement would put on the table. We are concerned that ignoring these concerns at this stage will also undermine or short-circuit mandatory processes of environmental and social impact assessment.

On the other hand, we note that the EU has initiated consultations with civil society stakeholders to ascertain their views about the areas covered by the proposed FTA with India.

Given this starkly visible imbalance in the practice of transparency and inclusive consultation processes adopted by the negotiating partners, we demand that the Government of India immediately take the following steps.

- 1. Give wide publicity and provide open access to proposals submitted to the EU by Government of India, as well as the responses to the textual proposals tabled by the EU which are publicly available.**
- 2. Give wide publicity and public access to the textual proposals received and responses submitted to other trading partners with whom FTA talks are going on.**
- 3. Create forums and platforms for public stakeholders and experts including civil society, academia and media representatives to submit their views on ongoing FTA negotiations with the EU and other countries.**
- 4. Ensure effective public participation in the negotiations by providing timely and comprehensive information on the status and details of the negotiations and holding dialogues and consultations with public stakeholders in India at each stage so that the negotiations are informed by the views and aspirations of all stakeholders.**

## List of Signatories:

	<b>Name</b>	<b>Profession/Affiliation</b>	<b>City</b>
1.	Aasin Khan	Social Activist	Alwar Rajasthan
2.	Abirami Raveendran	Unite	London
3.	Adv Dr Shalu Nigam	Lawyer	Delhi NCR
4.	Ajaykumar VB	Equitives Foundation	Trivandrum
5.	Albertina de J. P. Almeida	Advocate	Panaji, Goa.
6.	Amani	Student	Delhi
7.	Amita Joseph	Advocate	Delhi
8.	Amitava Choudhury	RTI Activist	Kolkata
9.	Anand Athialy	Student	Pune
10.	Anantharamkrishnan Senthivel	Assistant Professor of Criminology and Criminal Justice Administration	Chennai
11.	Anasuya Chandy	Teacher	Madanapalle
12.	Anil Chawla	Retired Army officer	Delhi
13.	Anita Cheria	Open Space	Bangalore
14.	Anita Kapoor	Social worker	New Delhi
15.	Annie Raja	G. Sec., National Federation of Indian Women	New Delhi
16.	Anuradha	Development Professional	Bangalore
17.	Anuradha Banerji	Saheli Women's Resource Centre	Delhi
18.	Ardhendu Sen	retired govt servant	coimbatore
19.	Arun Kumar	Retd Professor	Gurgaon
20.	Arun Mohan	Media Collective	New Delhi
21.	Aruna Rathnam	none	Chennai
22.	Arundhati Dhuru	NAPM	Lucknow
23.	Ashalatha S	MAKAAM	Hyderabad
24.	Ashok Maridas	Samvidhaanada Haadiyalli	Bangalore
25.	Ashok Shrimali	Social Activist	Ahmedabad
26.	Avinash Kumar	Researcher	New Delhi
27.	Beena Pallical	Independent Activist	New Delhi
28.	Benny Kuruvilla	Focus on the Global South -India	Delhi
29.	Brinda Adige	Activist	Bengaluru
30.	Brinelle D'souza	Chairperson, Centre for Health and Mental, School of Social Work Health, Tata Institute of Mumbai Social Sciences	
31.	Cedric Prakash	Human Rights and Peace Activist/Writer	Ahmedabad
32.	Chinmayi Naik	Working Peoples'Coalition	Bangalore
33.	D Gopalakrishna	Socialist Party, India	Bangalore
34.	Dev Desai	ANHAD	Ahmedabad
35.	Devaki Jain	Feminist economist	New Delhi
36.	Devidas Tuljapurkar	AIBEA Trade Union	Mumbai
37.	Dhirendra Panda	Social Work	Bhubaneswar
38.	Dimple Oberoi Vahali	Independent activist	Delhi
39.	Dinesh Abrol	Academic JNU TRCSS	Delhi
40.	Divya	Working	Bhopal
41.	Divyansh Khurana	Lawyer	Delhi
42.	Dolphy Dsouza	The Bombay Catholic Sabha	Mumbai
43.	Dorothy Fernandes	Social Action	Patna

44.	Dr. Sanjay Mangala Gopal	National Alliance of Peoples' Movements (NAPM)	Mumbai
45.	Eric Pinto	Nayional Alluance of Peoples Movement NAPM	Goa
46.	Gautam Bandyopadhyay	Nadi Ghati Morcha-India	Raipur
47.	Gautam Mody	NTUI	New Delhi
48.	Geetha Devarajan	Advocate	Chennai
49.	Govind Kelkar	Professor and Executive Director	Gurgaon
50.	Henri Tiphagne	People's Watch and Human Rights Defenders Alert India	Madurai
51.	Inamul	Social Activist	Chennai
52.	Isha Khandelwal	Lawyer	Bombay
53.	Janakarajan S	Professor, MIDS (Retd)	Chennai
54.	Jawhar Sircar	Member of Parliament TMC	Kolkata
55.	Joe Athialy	Centre for Financial Accountability	New Delhi
56.	Jomon Cheriyan James	Skiltrainer	Kottayam
57.	K. V. Bhat	Trade unionist. AITUC/JCTU	Bangalore
58.	Kalyani Menon Sen	Independent researcher	Coimbatore
59.	Kamayani Bali Mahabal	Independent Trainer	Mumbai
60.	Kameshwari Jandhyala	Independent consultant	Hyderabad
61.	karthik9425@gmail.com	Business	Bengaluru
62.	Kavita Krishnan	Feminist activist and author	New Delhi
63.	Krishna Sharma	Lawyer	New Delhi
64.	Kurien	Retiree	Bangalore
65.	L Krishnamurthy	Ex RTI Commissioner	Bangalore rural
66.	Lara Jesani	People's Union for Civil Liberties	Mumbai
67.	Leena	Social work activist	Ranchi
68.	Leo Saldanha	Environment Support Group	Bangalore
69.	Linda Chhakchhuak	Concerned Citizen	Shillong
70.	M G Devasahayam	People First	Bangalore
71.	Madhu Bhaduri	Retired government official	Delhi
72.	Mandar Prakhari	Student	Varanasi
73.	Manshi Asher	Independent Researcher	Palampur
74.	Mecanzy Dabre	National Hawkers Federation	Mumbai
75.	Medha Patkar	Narmada Bachao Andolan / NAPM	Badwani
76.	Meera Sanghamitra	National Alliance of People's Movements (NAPM)	Hyderabad
77.	Mohammad Chappalwala	Sambhaavnaa Institute	Palampur
78.	Mona Mishra	Independent Researcher	Delhi
79.	N Sai Balaji	National President, All India Students' Association (AISA)	Delhi
80.	Narendra Gupta	JSAR	Chittorgarh
81.	Narendra Mohanty	Activist, State Convener, INSAF & Campaign Against Fabricated Cases, Odisha.	Bhubaneswar
82.	National Hawker Federation	1300 Association	Kolkata
83.	Navsharan Singh	Independent Researcher	Delhi
84.	Nikhil Dey	Mazdoor Kisan Shakti Sangathan ( MKSS)	Rajsamand
85.	Nisha Biswas	Activists	Kolkata
86.	P.R.Dasgupta	Member of CCG	Bangalore
87.	P.Vijayakumar	Teacher (retired.)	Madurai
88.	Pamela Philipose	Independent journalist	New Delhi

89.	Panchaksharam.K	Founder / SIPA Fair Trade	Chennai
90.	Persis Ginwalla	Independent	Ahmedabad
91.	Prafulla Samantara	National Alliance Of People's Movements of India	Bhubaneswar
92.	Prasad Chacko	Independent Consultant	Ahmedabad
93.	Praskanva Sinharay	Centre for Financial Accountability Director & Professor (R), Mumbai school of Economics & Public Policy, University of Mumbai	New Delhi
94.	Prof Ritu Dewan	Independent Researcher	Mumbai
95.	Pushkar Raj	HRDA India	Melbourne
96.	R. Manohar	mines minarals & People	Bangalore
97.	R.Ravi & Ashok Shrimali	Student	Vishakhapatnam
98.	Rachel Andrews	NAPM, Delhi	Mumbai
99.	Rajendra Ravi	Editor, Sarvodaya Press Service	Delhi
100.	Rakesh Diwan	Independent Researcher	Bhopal
101.	Rakhi Sehgal	Indigenous Perspectives	New Delhi
102.	Ram Wangkheirakpam	None	Imphal
103.	Ramesh G	Researcher	Hyderabad
104.	Ravindra Sinha	University of Groningen	Pune
105.	Ritumbra Manuvie	Environment Activist	Groningen
106.	Rohit Prajapati	Independent activist and freelance professional	Vadodara
107.	Runu	(Retired Professor) PUCL Madurai	Gaziabad
108.	S.Krishnaswamy	Veterinary Scientist , Food Sovereignty Alliance	Madurai
109.	Sagari R Ramdas	Teaching	Hyderabad
110.	Samuel Asir Raj	PUCL, Maharashtra	Tirunelveli
111.	sandhya gokhale	Citizen	mumbai
112.	Satyarupa Shekhar	Former Central Information Commissioner	Cuttack
113.	Shailesh Gandhi	AICCTU	Mumbai
114.	Shankar V	Retired civil servant	Bangalore
115.	Sharad Behar	Concerned Indian	BHOPAL
116.	Shilpan	NAPM	San Francisco, CA, USA
117.	Sudhir Vombatkere	Retd. Teacher, University of Hyderabad	Mysuru
118.	Sujata Patel	Lawyer	Pune
119.	Sukumaran Krishnan	Individual	Gudalur The Nilgiris
120.	Tara Murali	Journalist, Human Rights Defender & Educationist	Chennai
121.	Teesta Setalvad	Law student	Mumbai
122.	Tejas Tinjan	Farmer, citizen of India	Faridabad
123.	Uma Shankari	Law student	Hyderabad
124.	V.Samarth Rao	Citizen	New Delhi
125.	Vasundhar	Independent Researcher	Mysore
126.	Veena Shatrugna	Indian Social Action Forum	Bengaluru
127.	Vidya Dinker	Commonwealth Human Rights Initiative	Mangalore
128.	Venkatesh Nayak	Community organiser	New Delhi
129.	Vijayasingh Ronald David	General Secretary, All India Kisan Sabha	Kushalnagara
130.	Vijoo Krishnan		New Delhi

131. Vineet	Mazdoor Kisan Shakti Sangathan	Rajsamand, Rajasthan
132. Vinita Balekundri	Maharashtra Hawkers Federation	Navi Mumbai
133. Vinod Koshy	Dynamic Action	Thiruvalla
134. Vivekanand Tripathi	Social Activist	Noida
135. Wilfred Dcosta	Indian Social Action Forum	New Delhi
136. Yashaswini Krishna	Student pursuing master's in mass communication and media	Bengaluru
137. Yashika Manav	Dehli Girls Rising - National Confederation of Dalit and Adivasi Organisations (NACDAOR)	New Delhi
138. डॉ. सुगन बरंड	सर्वोदय कार्यकर्ता	मालेगांव (नासिक)